IMPACT ASSESSMENT OF SKILLS TRAINING FOR SLUM DWELLERS

Prepared By

Mr. Joshua Bryant

December, 2009

Prepared for

swiss contact
# Table of Contents

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY ................................................................................................ 2

1. INTRODUCTION .......................................................................................................... 4
    Goals and Objectives ................................................................................................. 4

2. BACKGROUND ............................................................................................................ 5
    Community Development Library and Chetona Bikash Kendra ................................ 5
    Financial Breakdown of CDL and CBK ...................................................................... 6
    CBK Course Curricula ............................................................................................... 7

3. METHODOLOGY ......................................................................................................... 7
    Process of Data Collection ....................................................................................... 8
    Major Constraints of the Study ................................................................................ 8

4. FINDINGS AND RESPONSES ..................................................................................... 9
    Demography ............................................................................................................... 9
    Graduates Responses ............................................................................................... 10
    Current Students Responses ................................................................................... 15
    CDL/CBK Administrator and Teacher/Trainer Responses ...................................... 19

5. STRATEGIES AND RECOMMENDATIONS ........................................................... 24
    Organizational Change .............................................................................................. 24
    Scale-up and Expansion ........................................................................................... 25

6. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS ........................................................................... 26

ANNEXES ........................................................................................................................ 28
    Annex 1 – Case Profiles ......................................................................................... 28
    Annex 3 – Sample Questionnaire ........................................................................... 31
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

There is a very real opportunity for offering support to the programs of the Community Development Library and its vocational skills training program at Chetona Bikash Kendra—and for creating a comprehensive program which can be readily demonstrated as a viable model for workforce capacity building, skills training and livelihoods development in Bangladesh. Further studies on feasibility and market-related surveys should be foremost in determining the next steps in addressing the organization of programs under the CDL base of operations, more generally, and CBK vocational programs specifically. Ultimately, the advantages and underlying organizational foundations of CDL and CBK should be utilized in creating a much more expansive and effective venue of programs developing skills training and capacity building under CBK exists presently.

This report is meant to provide a general purview of the socio-economic situation facing students and graduates of the CBK vocational training program at Rayer Bazar, in Dhaka City; the figures and descriptive analysis have pointed to the overall impact of the CBK vocational programs administered by the CDL under its current funding by Swisscontact. While the information given here has not meant to provide statistical accuracy in relationship to the sample of respondents, all of the information gathered has relevance to the subject herein which is how graduates and current students feel about the success and effectiveness of the CBK training and the changes it has brought about in their lives respectively.

Overwhelmingly, the participants of the survey have submitted that the programs have been helpful to them in securing suitable employment and in generating income within the social, familial and financial constraints that they face in the slum catchments at Rayer Bazar. While the increased subsistence experienced by CBK graduates in their employment activities may in fact seem slim to marginal overall—the personal testimony given in KII shows that this seemingly subtle increase in household income and sustenance has made, not only a noticeable impact on a majority of CBK graduates, but has actually created a profound change in the lives and livelihoods of graduates utilizing the skills training that they have received from CDL and CBK.

The Strategies and Recommendations derived from this study have been based on the findings and responses generated from the three stakeholder groups who were included (CBK Graduates, CBK Current Students and CDL/CBK Administrators and Teacher/Trainers). The recommendations for future program activities follow two different levels of initiation:

→ Change at the organizational level in terms of capacity, planning, management and delivery;

→ Change in scope of programs in terms of scale-up and expansion. The rationale for these different macro- and micro-level changes will be discussed as points of departure and enumerated below.

Organizational Change and Capacity building should take place at the organizational level—focusing on programs and personnel. Technical Assistance can be provided on a range of capacity-building interventions for both CDL and CBK.

1) Feasibility and marketing surveys on economic realities and relationships for and between inhabitants and businesses in the area of Rayer Bazar—demand for goods, services and skills, as well as employment opportunities.

2) Increase the capacities of CDL and CBK Administrators and Teacher/Trainers—organizational management; up-skilling courses in trades; training in the delivery of course curricula.

3) Increase organizational capacities in technological applications. New technologies should be incorporated into both the organizational management programs; as well as within course curricula.
4) Skills-base within existing courses should be enhanced and centered on skills in demand—training should be developed in collaboration with national skill level, as well as industry standards. Certifications should be linked with national competency-based standards and assessment tools.

5) Substantial linkages should be facilitated between the programs and both the public and private sectors.

6) The CBK should forge linkages with national policy programs and NGO program interventions based in workforce capacity development and technical skills training (e.g. the International Labor Organization’s Technical and Vocational Educational Training (TVET) Reform Project; et al).

7) CDL and CBK should develop new post-program support and services which can be extended to students who have completed the course training.

Scale-up and Expansion should be shifted to after a substantial drive towards building organizational capacity at the programmatic and personnel level:

1) Course curricula should be vastly expanded in terms of number and breadth of technical and vocational trades and training offered under CBK curricula in new demand-centered trades.

2) CBK training should also include comprehensive Entrepreneurship Development and Business Management (EDBM) training for trainees attempting to run micro enterprises.

3) Revenue generation schemes should developed as a means of supplementing program activities without donor assistance.

4) The organizational layout of CDL and CBK should be redesigned to follow modern educational/institutional planning models.

5) The basic model of the CBK tailoring shop should be invested in as a legitimate business opportunity, and developed on a redesigned and more formidable business driven by comprehensive market research.

6) Organizational support should be driven by regular international capital/funding campaigns also used as a means of marketing program activities, as well as products.

7) “Brick and mortar” development of facilities and installations should be used to adapt a mode of program expansion, both within other urban areas of Dhaka, and/or other large urban areas of Bangladesh; and should not overlook the possibility of adapting a rural approach to skills training and workforce capacity building.

The scope for a considerable up-scaling and expansion of programming exists currently; with donor facilitation of appropriate and necessary linkages with the public, private and NGO sectors; technical support and design for the future course of strategic programming—CDL and CBK show the potential to become flagship programs in Bangladesh on demonstrating effective capacity-building programs for livelihoods development, and skills training through vocational education.
1. INTRODUCTION

The Consultant’s Tracer Study and Impact Assessment of Chetona Bikash Kendra (CBK) Vocational School has utilized and incorporated the qualitative methodologies using Participatory Urban Appraisal (PUA) techniques—questionnaires for Key Informant Interviews (KIIs) and Expert Consultations with key stakeholders; a review of primary documents from Community Development Library (CDL)/CBK programming and organizational publications; CBK graduates’ assessment of their employment situation and their feedback on CBK vocational training curricula and methodologies; evaluation of CBK’s vocational training progress and limitations based on feedback from teacher-trainers and administrators, record keeping, monitoring and tracking of graduates; future potential of employment opportunities for CBK graduates taken from within context of the overall socio-economic condition in the slum catchments; expansion of trade and other commercial activities; as well as the status of presently unemployed graduates in respect of their number, trends, major constraints in employment and possible methods for interventions and support.

KIIs were given at Rayer Bazar, Dhanmondi in Dhaka City where the majority of CBK graduates work and reside. Individual KII interviews were given with the CBK graduates, current students and CBK teacher-trainers as well as CDL and CBK administrative personnel. The primary intent of the KIIs was in discerning CBK graduates perceptions, wishes, choices and perceived obstacles in securing employment and/or further educational opportunities; as well as their sentiment on the need for, reasons for engaging, as well as the overall quality of their training under CDL/CBK vocational program. The composition of the KII guidelines was designed in direct consultation with Swiss Contact and finalized according to their review and recommendations.

Goals and Objectives

The objectives of the consultant’s study have been to assess the impact and contribution of CBK vocational training in improving the socio-economic status of inhabitants from Rayer Bazar. In looking at the overall impact of program objectives and accomplishments under CBK training and educational initiatives, the consultant’s study has sought to provide a detailed assessment of the following:

→ Assessing the upward mobility and increased earning potential of CBK graduates, alongside the impact of vocational training for individual graduates based on his or her standard of living and socio-economic status based on family size and combined household income.

→ Existing training curricula and teaching/training materials used in the instruction of learners as well as teacher-trainers used by the CBK vocational training center.

→ Views and critique of teaching/training modalities from: current CBK students; CBK graduates who have obtained employment; and CBK graduates who have not been availed of gainful employment post-training, and who remain unemployed.

→ Effectiveness of current revenue generating activities of CBK (in course fees, capital campaigns and fundraising, et al) in increasing the center’s income and overall budget for the skills training program.

→ Potential enhancements for scalability and sustainability of CBK program activities under the direction of CDL administrators and further interventions staged by Swisscontact as a partner of the CDL and CBK vocational training program at Rayer Bazar—likewise, which activities currently employed for revenue generation by the organization, and which could be undertaken to add supplemental revenue to program activities that would be suitable in securing sustainability; or increasing the scale of program activities through expansion (from increased revenue sources).

The consultant’s study of opportunities (or lack there of) for graduates of the CBK program for employment and income generation, will collect evidence on the possibilities which exist for CBK graduates to access alternative options for employment, continued education and/or skills development training for suitable area specific employment needs and demand with in the area of Rayer Bazar slum. The study will provide results based evidence for future interventions in the area of urban slums, focussing providing analysis by constructing a general profile of learners/graduates’ socio-economic status, and in
considering the fundamental constraints and challenges for CBK graduates to further their employment and income generating opportunities by negotiating their socio-economic standing through skills training, job/income generation acquisition through available employment opportunities.

This Tracer Study and Assessment will provide recommendations that will consider possible interventions which can be taken in the context Swisscontact strategic objectives for developing the vocational training of the CBK program—providing an approach that will review potential enhancements that can be made to programming, and which will better cater to the needs of Rayer Bazar inhabitants seeking training as a means of securing more suitable and viable employment and income generating opportunities.

2. BACKGROUND

From 1971 priority was given to extending the right of primary Education for All (EFA) in Bangladesh at the policy level. However, the 70s and 80s saw a huge gender disparity in school enrollment figures along with inequalities in access to education. The 1990s saw a renewed commitment to increasing spending on basic education. However, the education system in Bangladesh has not since eradicated the inequalities in providing affordable quality education for all segments of society. Non Formal Education (NFE) adopts a bottom-up, area-specific approach to delivering mass primary and basic education. NFE policy was adopted by the Government of Bangladesh (GoB) in 2006, and has since developed a regulatory body that is dedicated to the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals (MGDs) response of providing EFA.1

While general and basic education have been at the top of the list as far as improving the overall educational disparities in Bangladesh as means of poverty eradication; skills development and workforce capacity building through technical and vocational education have increasingly received focus as an essential part of educational development in Least Developed Countries (LDCs) such as Bangladesh—particularly with respect to non-formal learning and the inclusion of historically marginalized and excluded groups from technical and vocational educational training and skills development. International donors such as the International Labor Organization, UNDP and Swisscontact have targeted workforce capacity building through technical and vocational training and skills development as a major objective of several different programs in Bangladesh.

Community Development Library and Chetona Bikash Kendra

“CDL strives to contribute to a society where every citizen has right and access to knowledge and information necessary to improve their living condition and to have access to different livelihoods options.” – CDL Promotional Material

The Community Development Library (CDL) was established in 1980 with funding from the Hilfswerk der Evangelischen Kirchen Schweiz (HEKS, “the aid organization of the Protestant Churches of Switzerland”), and with the aim of providing critical informational resources to projects centered on relief and development in Bangladesh. The CDL sees education as the foremost basis for poverty alleviation, and has dedicated its mission and resources to aiding in educational development in the country. The CDL has five main programs:

→ Central Library Documentation & Information Centre (CELDIC)—main administrative offices at Dhanmondi, Dhaka City.
→ Rural Information Resource Centers (RIRC)—24 district-level offices throughout Bangladesh.
→ Chetona Bikash Kendra (CBK)—Basic Education up to Grade V, and Vocational Education and skills training in Tailoring, Cutting, Sewing, Embroidery and Block Batik.
→ Annual research publications.
→ Development Resource Promotion Center (Publications Sales Center)

The Chetona Bikash Kendra (CBK, “Center for Awareness Development”) is a vocational training institute established by the CDL in combating illiteracy, and the lacking access of urban slum children to any means of skills development and training, as well as basic education. The CBK has graduated approximately 800-850 boys and girls through its basic educational program (Grades I - V) in subsequent years since 2003—and about 150 vocational training graduates annually. Currently, the CBK maintains a scholarship fund through which it provides 47 scholarships to basic education graduates in continuing their education. These scholarships support students continuing in Class VI – IX, Secondary School Certification (Class X), Higher Secondary Certification (Class XII), as well as at the University level.

**Financial Breakdown of CDL and CBK**

The CDL supports the cost of operating the CBK vocational training program by utilizing the production of students to generate income for sales taken from various individual orders. While the primary funding for the CBK skills training program has been provided by Swisscontact over the past five years—a proportion of the total operational costs (approximately 35%) are supplemented by the revenue generated from tailoring shop sales to the local community.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of the Project</th>
<th>Name of the Donors</th>
<th>Received Fund</th>
<th>Operating Cost</th>
<th>Surplus/Deficit</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Community Education Programme</td>
<td>HEKS, SWITZERLAND</td>
<td>5,007,240</td>
<td>(5,812,725)</td>
<td>(805,485)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chetana Bikash Kendra (CBK), School for Slum Children</td>
<td>HEKS</td>
<td>4,270,439</td>
<td>(3,669,929)</td>
<td>(600,510)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Library Service and Development</td>
<td>MISEREOR, GERMANY</td>
<td>3,133,281</td>
<td>(3,977,403)</td>
<td>(844,122)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrating PWDs and Women in Development through Knowledge and Capacity Building, Co-ordination, Information Sharing and Advocacy of CDL</td>
<td>ANDHERI HILFE, GERMANY</td>
<td>1,187,304</td>
<td>(1,206,581)</td>
<td>(19,277)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Narrowing the Knowledge and Information Gap Between Haves and Have Nots Rich and Poor Urban and Rural Regions Information sharing Awareness Raising and Capacity Building</td>
<td>CHRISTIAN AID, LONDON</td>
<td>2,467,156</td>
<td>(2,768,537)</td>
<td>(301,381)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBK Vocational</td>
<td>SWISS CONTACT</td>
<td>460,874</td>
<td>(707,424)</td>
<td>(246,550)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBK Scholarship</td>
<td>CDL Contribution</td>
<td>37,000</td>
<td>(37,000)</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>16,333,300</strong></td>
<td><strong>(18,179,599)</strong></td>
<td><strong>(1,846,299)</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There is a per-item fabrication charge to patrons of the CBK tailoring shop which is approximately 80 BDT per piece. Part of this fee is paid to CBK students for their labor (40%) while the margin (approximately averaging 5-10% on each piece) on the total mark-up for products as well as the remaining 60% of the per-item fabrication charge is kept by the program in order to supplement funds and operational costs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2.2 – CBK Annual Budget and Funding fyr. 2008 – 2009 (in BDT)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Funding Provided by Swisscontact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revenue Generated by CBK Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total CBK Operational Costs 2008 - 2009</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CBK purportedly has customers who are business people who purchase clothing and garments on order from the CBK Shop, and sell the items competitively in larger markets in Dhaka. However, most of the sales generated by CBK program graduates and well as the CBK tailoring shop remain local to Rayer Bazar, and rely mainly on word of mouth for marketing, as well as through the personal contacts of CDL.
and CBK program staff (i.e. friends, family and acquaintances). CBK also charges a per-course fee to students for classes (50 BDT per month/per course). As will be discussed in more detail below, students are only able to take at most two courses for every 6 month session of classes (this would amount to approximately 600 BDT per student enrolled in two training courses). Many of the students only take one training course during each 6 month session.

**CBK Course Curricula**

There are 4 Course Modules for CBK training curricula. Each course consists of a 6-month course in each trade for covering the material in each syllabus respectively. As mentioned above, students usually take one or two courses in each 6-month training session, and are charged on a monthly basis for each course that is taken. The four courses consist of:

→ **Sewing** (stitching; and sewing machine operation and maintenance)
→ **Tailoring** (measuring and cutting for specific clothing items)
→ **Embroidery** (design; design tracing from paper to cloth; and embroidery machine maintenance and operation)
→ **Block Batik** (color combination/mixing; block printing techniques)

Each course has instruction in theory as well as practical application and demonstration. Teacher/trainers use course “Guidebooks” in classroom instruction partially. Students compile “Notebooks” which follow the daily notes and instruction of the teacher/trainers. Teachers will sign off on completed units within each course—such as diagrams and drawings made by students in their individual notebooks—and will closely monitor the progress of students on a day-to-day basis, helping to correct errors in note-taking.

Another form of instructional methodology are the duplication of measurements, diagrams or patterns on large sheets of paper. These large sheets are used when students are demonstrated how to physically apply the skills in hands-on training through practical application. Students are administered one Mid-Term evaluation (worth 15 marks in theory-based knowledge); and one Final Examination (worth 100 marks—50 in theory and 50 in practical demonstration). While the passing grade for examinations is 40%, students on average pass at 70-80%, with many passing at 90-100%.

### 3. METHODOLOGY

This *Tracer Study and Impact Assessment* has incorporated the quantitative *methodologies of Participatory Urban Appraisal: Expert Consultations and Key Informant Interviews (KII)*. The
data and findings have been gathered and assimilated all of the according to the profiling indicators set forth in the KII questionnaire guidelines. In addition to conducting a review of available program documents from CDL and CBK, the KII questionnaires were drafted with the intention to collect mainly qualitative and inferential data. However, a portion of the findings will include quantified and enumerated data reflecting personal and demographic information of the subjects who were interviewed; and should help to construct a general purview of the socio-economic situation facing CBK program participants. A database has been prepared with a complete record of enumerated findings, as well as the original contact list of stakeholders: CBK current students; graduates; administrators and teacher-trainers. In all, the consultant’s study has provided a sample of 51 participants:

**Table 3.1 – Total Number of KII by Gender and Number of Respondents in Different Stakeholder Groups**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Graduates KII</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current Students KII</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL CBK PROGRAM PARTICIPANT KII</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDL/CBK Administrators and Teacher Trainers KII</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL KII INTERVIEWS</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Process of Data Collection**

**Key Informant Interviews (KII):** the research team, comprised of the lead consultant and interviewer/enumerators, has conducted one-on-one KIIIs with individual respondents to gather information on constraints, opportunities and improvements that can be made within CBK vocational training programs. The interviews have been conducted through structured questionnaires have derived some quantitative data, but has also extended discussion with respondents in order to supplement the structured findings of the questionnaires with qualitative information as well. Hence, the data collection exercise has been quantitative as well as qualitative in nature.

The sample respondents have all been interviewed and consulted through structured guidelines developed for KII questionnaires administered during field activities by Bangla-speaking interviewers. The interviewers where charged with conducting simultaneous translation of the questionnaires from English into Spoken Bangla for the respondents—who gave all responses and remarks in Bangla, which was then translated and recorded into written English on the individual KII questionnaires. All of the data collected in the field and recorded on the KII questionnaires was gone over collectively by the consultant and the interviewers. All of the quantifiable data was then transposed into a spreadsheet format, including the contact list—with additional comments and remarks recorded during individual interviews and separated according to stakeholder group and KII questionnaire design—were compiled into three separate documents respective of stakeholder group. These qualitative findings will be given, along with the quantified data in the following section of this report on findings. The duration of the survey interviews took place over two (2) weeks from the 8th to the 16th of November, 2009.

**Major Constraints of the Study**

With the stated objectives (as mentioned in the Terms of Reference, TOR): “…will also attempt to include consultations with key stakeholders in the private sector (i.e. local and available employers)… Target – approximately 10 – 15 employers in the area of Rayer Bazar” - p. 2, NO/BH/Terms of Reference/160909.

→ Constraints were experienced in terms of days available for field activities and the availability of key personnel for KII interviews (i.e. enumerators)

→ Constraints were also experienced in attempting to contact local employers and set up interviews, it was determined these interviews were going to be extremely limited in terms of the information they
would be able to provide under the circumstances and overall objectives of the study and assessment. Therefore, under “Strategies and Recommendations” have recommended a more comprehensive Markey Survey and analysis for determining the relevance of local employers both inside and outside of Rayer Bazar.

With the stated objectives from TOR: “Target – approximately 40 – 50 CBK graduates who have found employment…” [and] “Target – approximately 10 – 15 unemployed graduates…”- p. 2, NO/BH/Terms of Reference/160909.

Another issue of constraints do to time and resources. Over 5 days 2 enumerators (short from 3 proposed) were each able to complete 8 – 10 interviews between the two per day. On the first day of field activities and KIIs, it was discovered that traveling within Rayer Bazar to each potential respondents home was much too time-consuming—as only 4 interviews in total were taken in the first day of activities—respondents were then given appointments to come to the CBK facility for interviews. Under this approach the enumerators were able to complete 8 – 10 interviews/day.

Under a revised schedule for interviews, it was determined that only 30 – 40 interviews with all CBK graduates would be possible, and hence, 34 graduates in total completed KIIs—28 employed graduates and 6 unemployed graduates.

With the stated objective: “6. Timeframe: The study has to be completed in a period of four weeks including the submission of the final report.”- p. 3, NO/BH/Terms of Reference/160909.

Within the first week-and-a-half of the consultant signing the contract, several resource persons who had been confirmed to participate in the completion of the assignment as enumerators/translators, all declined their involvement and ability to participate on account of various reasons which were given.

From the point of contract signing, up until the start of field activities and the delivery of the KIIs (on the 8th of November), available and willing replacements for the key personnel who had originally been sourced for the project, were not forthcoming. While 2 replacements were found, extra time was spent attempting to source a third. When the 3rd enumerator/translator was still absent going into the 2nd week after contract signing, it was determined by the consultant to be imperative to begin undertaking field activities, under a revised schedule, with the two available enumerators/translators. For this reason alone, the subsequent delay in time frame objectives was experienced.

4. FINDINGS AND RESPONSES

Demography

The following general demographic statistics have been compiled from the sampled CBK program participants (Graduates and Current Students):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>General Information, Table 4.1</th>
<th>CBK Graduates</th>
<th>CBK Current Students</th>
<th>ALL CBK Participants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Average Household Size (No. of Persons)</td>
<td>4.06</td>
<td>5.10</td>
<td>4.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Age (Years)</td>
<td>25.68</td>
<td>24.9</td>
<td>25.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age Range (Years)</td>
<td>18-40</td>
<td>18-53</td>
<td>18-53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married/Single/Divorced</td>
<td>28 / 8 / 1</td>
<td>2 / 8 / 0</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Educational Level</td>
<td>Class 8</td>
<td>Class 7</td>
<td>Class 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Range of Educational Levels</td>
<td>Class 1-12</td>
<td>Class 1-14</td>
<td>Class 1-14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Number of Months Employed Since CBK Training (Graduates)</td>
<td>17.3 Months</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Number of Months Unemployed Since CBK Training (Graduates)</td>
<td>11 Months</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Previous Work/Training Experience Prior to CBK Training</td>
<td>26.5%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The above tables have been given to show an overall compilation of figures extrapolated from background sections of the CBK Graduates and Current Students KII questionnaires. No such figures were recorded for CDL or CBK Administrators and Teacher/Trainers, and are hence not shown in the tables above. The figures above reflect statistical averages within the sample data, and are only meant to show these relationships generally. The above figures do not reflect a statistically accurate sample of the two groups of respondents (Graduates and Current Students). The figures assembled above are meant to give a general numeric representation of the socio-economic situation of CBK program participants. The following subsections of the *Findings and Responses* of the report will also give a more qualitative description of the Study and Impact Assessment objectives, which receive a general numeric interpretation; but that also provide further detail in the recorded responses by interviewees towards each question in its respective stakeholder KII, and that were given more elaboration by interviewees.

**Graduates Responses**

**ii. Responses to the Question: Do you feel your current occupation is a suitable source of employment for you?**

Given responses:

→ Yes I think it’s very good
→ Yes I think it’s ok but not best/could be better
→ No I don’t think my current employment is suitable at all

65% of Graduates Responded: “Yes I think it’s very good”  
17.5% of Graduates Responded: “Yes I think it’s ok but not best/could be better”  
17.5% of Graduates gave no response: (n/a)

The most prominent reasons for the response “very good” were notated as their current occupations in tailoring meets both their needs in terms of obligations to the household, as well as in being able to generate income: “I am able to maintain my family and household while I am earning and working at my job.” Several respondents noted a relief from “pressure” in their current work, as well that they were able to work at their “own pace and convenience”. As most CBK Graduates are self employed (i.e. working from their households independently), many regarded the ability to work in self employment as a very good benefit to their productivity and livelihoods.

---

* All CBK Graduates are working in Tailoring or Garments-Related businesses—one CBK Graduate is also and “errand boy” at a hotel in addition to working as an embroidery technician.

* Pacca = Finished apartment dwelling with concrete walls and roof; Semi-Pacca = Semi-finished apartment dwelling with concrete walls, and tin or thatched roof; Tin Shed/Bamboo = Weak construction with tin walls, siding and roof, and/or bamboo supports/foundation.
For CBK Graduates who responded “ok but not best” most regarded their standing in employment (whether self-employed or wage-employed) as not being as good as working as a “shop owner” or manager. For these individuals, the ability to run a business with employees would be a better or more suitable form of employment: employment “could have been better if I was able to open a tailoring shop.” No response given by CBK graduates was in all accounts a result of being unemployed, and hence, not having any source of employment at all.

iii. Response to the question: What are the major constraints that you see yourself facing in having or trying to find the best employment? (multiple responses given)

Given responses:
- Family Constraints
- Job – Related Only
- Can’t find good Opportunities
- Income Related
- Community Problems
- Can’t find support
- There are other outside problems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Family Constraints</th>
<th>Job-Related Only</th>
<th>Can’t Find Good Opportunities</th>
<th>Income Related</th>
<th>Community Problems</th>
<th>Can’t Find Support</th>
<th>There are Other Outside Problems</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>38.2%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>14.7%</td>
<td>23.5%</td>
<td>2.9%</td>
<td>41.2%</td>
<td>5.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The most actively pursued response by graduates “can’t find support” was further elaborated that the support that was specifically being mentioned was financial: “If I could find the necessary financial support I would be able to purchase my own sewing machine” and/or other materials or inputs for their business. In this regard, “income related” is also akin to “financial support” in that several respondents regarded their wages as a constraint in having/finding suitable employment—also relating income to “productivity” as well as in instances of wage-based employment, on the inability to receive higher levels of remuneration.

Secondly, “family constraints” generated several different but frequently mentioned responses. In most cases, respondents, the majority of whom being female, remarked that their families and/or husbands were restrictive of them working outside of the household in any form of employment—and that these circumstances were often linked to household responsibilities as well, such as taking care of children or maintaining the family home.

“Good opportunities” also seemed to indicate lacking support in the form of a loan or the insufficient wages that were being earned through wage-based employment. “Other outside problems” were also mentioned in relation to the conditions of wage-based employment, and poor working environments.

iv. Responses to the question: What do you feel are some possible solutions for overcoming these [your constraints in finding employment] problems? (Multiple responses given)

Given responses:
- More/Better Skills/Training for Employment
- More (General) Educational Opportunities
- More Financial Support
- More Community Support
- More Access to Better Jobs
- Less Problems from Outside
- Less Problems from Community
“More financial support” was the foremost response given by CBK Graduates; noting that if they were able to receive financial support from an “institution, it would aid in establishing a small business tailoring shop”. Skill training was also a significant response, as it was noted as being essential to acquiring more skills in their field—that if they were able to become “renown” for their skill by the community, they would receive more orders and be able to increase the quality and profitability of their business. One noted response by a graduate was that “skills training is the first weapon, followed by education and community support—if we have these plus financial support then we are better able to overcome our problems.”

v. Responses to the question: What do you see as being the best business opportunities, or possibilities for employment and income in your area, can you list them? (Multiple responses given)

Garments-related Businesses were mentioned in 91.2% of responses by CBK Graduates (i.e. tailoring, embroidery, block batik, etc).

Non-garments-related businesses were mentioned in 38.2% of responses by CBK Graduates. Among the non-garments-related businesses specifically mentioned by graduates were the following:

- Tannery-related business
- Footwear and leather business
- Cottage industry (small-scale, home-based production units)
- Handicrafts

When asked: Why can’t you take advantage of these opportunities?—a range of responses were given by CBK Graduates. Most often remarked by graduates was that 1) the lack of access to capital/financing [to start a small business such as a tailoring shop]; 2) the lack of interest in pursuing other opportunities outside of their current training, and that only if they were to “fail” at this would they consider pursuing other business/job related activities. Several graduates also responded that they felt these other (i.e. non-garments related) business/job opportunities to not be “suitable” or “secure”.

vi. Responses to the question: Which kinds of businesses/people in your area are unsuccessful, and why do you think that is?

Most graduates felt that the lack of success in business and/or employment in the area of Rayer Bazar was due to the lacking presence of any sort of industry, or the unsuitable “business environment” (e.g. heavy industry, or steel)—and that as a result there weren’t sufficient opportunities for the inhabitants of the area. Further remarks indicated that business which conduct commerce on a “credit system” were unsuccessful; as well as other businesses which were seen as being irrelevant to a “poorer” community, such as “fast food” or “air conditioning and refrigeration services”.

vii. Responses to the question: What is your preferred or most suitable form of employment?

Given responses:
- Self Employment
- Micro Enterprise (Producer Groups)
- Wage Employment
97% of CBK Graduates specified their preferred from of employment as being “self employment”. The most commonly given remark concerning self-employment by graduates was that there was a better opportunity to “earn more and [to have] more liberty in conducting one’s own business”; as well that self employment is “better for maintaining both the family and household as well as for having a job and generating income”—following previous responses on “family constraints” and the desirability of working from the home. Only one CBK Graduate respondent preferred to sell their labor in the form of wage employment—gaining a “salary so that [he] won’t have to experience any problems” with regard to receiving income (as opposed to struggling with seasonality and fluctuating demand).

viii. Responses to the question: Which skills to you think workers need to improve in order to gain better employment, or opportunities for generating income?

In descending order of frequency of responses (as well as complete rage of remarks):

1. “High Quality” or “Perfect Knowledge” in Technical Skills and Trades
2. Demand/Market Oriented Skills
3. General Education (up to Class 12)
4. “Willingness” and “Devotion” to work
5. Capacity to manage a business
6. Accounting and financial management skills
7. Entrepreneurship
8. Skills in “fashion garments” [i.e. fashionable wears; clothing design; and market trends]
9. Efficiency/productivity

ix. Responses to question: What were your reasons for joining the CBK program? (Multiple Responses Possible)

General responses from the interviewees were grouped together according to the following similar responses. The question in this instance did not generate an overwhelming majority within one category, but indicates a rage of responses as to why CBK graduates initially joined the training program.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>55.9%</td>
<td>52.9%</td>
<td>35.3%</td>
<td>8.8%</td>
<td>2.9%</td>
<td>5.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

x. Responses to question: Do you think that the training you received from CBK was effective/good?

Given responses:

→ Very Very Good and Effective
→ Only Good only Maybe Effective
→ Don’t Know
→ Not Good Not Really Effective
→ Very Very Bad and Not Effective At All

100% of CBK Graduates responded that they felt the training was “very very good and effective”. A majority of these responses were based on the ability of the graduates to “earn income as a result of completing the training”; and even where graduates are currently unemployed, the CBK training is still seen as a very good and effective means of skills training solely on the basis of other CBK graduates being able to establish their own businesses and generate income upon their completion of training.
xi. Responses to the question: What are the major differences you experienced in your life due to CBK training? (Multiple responses possible)

Given responses:
→ Better Income
→ Better Job/Employment
→ Better Family/Household Situation
→ Better Situation/More Respect in Community
→ Only a little Change but Not Much Life Change
→ No Real Life Change after CBK Training at All

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Better Income</th>
<th>Better Job/Employment</th>
<th>Better Family/Household Situation</th>
<th>More Respect in the Community</th>
<th>Not Much Life Change</th>
<th>No Real Life Changes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>85.3%</td>
<td>29.4%</td>
<td>82.4%</td>
<td>85.3%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>14.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The most common responses in the instance of the question above are given most often together: “better income”; “better family/household situation”; and “more respect in the community”. Therefore, it can be assumed that the major life changes with regard to CBK Graduates has to do with 1) levels of income being increased; and 2) that increased income can lead to a better household situation and better respect in the community. Most of the respondents felt that these changes were extremely significant—being able to “participate in more fully in the decision-making of the household”; “being able to contribute to the education of [their own] children”; as well as acquiring better lodgings and household amenities such as furniture and decorations. All those who remarked that they had experienced “no real life changes…” were also unemployed. Most of these however, remarked that they anticipated that they would still be able to find employment or establish their own business, and that they would experience significant changes once they were able to accomplish this.

xii. Responses to the question: What was lacking in the training you received from CBK that could have improved the quality of the training that you received? (Multiple responses possible)

Given responses:
→ Needs Better Teachers/Trainers
→ Needs Better Learning Materials/Tools
→ Needs Better Facilities
→ Needs Better Schedule for Classes (More/Different Times)
→ Needs MORE Courses in DIFFERENT Skills/Trades
→ Needs BETTER Courses on CURRENT Skills/Trades

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Better Teacher/Trainers</th>
<th>Better Learning Materials</th>
<th>Better Facilities</th>
<th>Better Schedule for Classes</th>
<th>More Courses in Different Trades</th>
<th>Better Courses in Current Trades</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>47.1%</td>
<td>94.1%</td>
<td>32.4%</td>
<td>8.8%</td>
<td>29.4%</td>
<td>26.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Almost ubiquitously, CBK Graduates felt that their training could have been better if they were trained in “more modern tools and materials…[such as] knit machines; interlocking machines; button hole machines”; and (most predominantly) in “electric sewing machines”—maintenance and operation. Classroom size and space was noted as a reason for “better facilities”; and almost equal proportions of graduates felt the courses could have either been expanded to cover skills in “different” trades, or
“better courses” in current trades, presumably following in the aforementioned “better” and more modern learning materials. “Fashion Garments” were also mentioned as a subsequent training that could be offered in CBK training.

xiii. Responses to the question: Would you move to another area/district/region for employment, yes or no/why or why not?

88.2% of respondents remarked that they would NOT move for employment. Most commonly cited was that they felt that their current employment was suitable; and that they had ample opportunity to generate income at Rayer Bazar. Many of the women also remarked that their family restrictions also limited them from pursuing employment opportunities in other areas—being married with a husband working in the area, and/or having a family, or being confined to working from the household, if allowed to work all—were also frequently mentioned.

xiv. Responses to the question: What are your future plans in view of the training you have received, and your experiences with CBK in terms of career planning? (Multiple responses possible)

Given responses:
→ Keep Same Employment
→ Try to Expand Your Business
→ Try to Increase Quality of Your Business
→ Look for New Employment
→ Look for New Educational Opportunities
→ Look for New Skills/Training Opportunities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Keep Same Employment</th>
<th>Try to Expand Business</th>
<th>Increase the Quality of Business</th>
<th>Look for New Employment</th>
<th>Look for Ed. Opportunities</th>
<th>Look for Training Opportunities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>20.6%</td>
<td>61.8%</td>
<td>17.6%</td>
<td>20.6%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In terms of business “expansion”, CBK graduates remarked that they were planning to take loans in order to start their own tailoring shops, purchase new machines, or to develop their self-employed businesses outright. Though “Looking for new training opportunities” was not specifically cited as a part of future business plans, it was remarked that development should proceed along these lines in order to improve overall business.

xv. Responses to questions: Would you like to have more or better training in your skill or trade from CBK? Would you like to have more training in another skill or trade?

100% of CBK Graduates responded that they would like to have more training in current skills and trades from CBK.

Only 44% of CBK Graduates responded that they would like to have more training in another skill or trade, however, all of the trades mentioned specifically by these graduates were the garments-related trades that CBK is currently offering, but not at the time of their training (i.e. embroidery and block batik).

**Current Students Responses**

i. Responses to the Question: Do you feel that the CBK training will lead to a suitable source of employment for you?
Given responses:
→ Yes I think it will
→ Yes I think it’s possible/maybe
→ No I don’t think it will lead to suitable employment in the future

40% of Current Students Responded: “Yes I think it will”
60% of Graduates Responded: “Yes/Maybe”

ii. Response to the question: *What are the major constraints that you see yourself facing in having or trying to find the best employment?* (multiple responses possible)

Given responses:
→ Family Constraints
→ Job – Related Only
→ Can’t find good Opportunities
→ Income Related
→ Community Problems
→ Can’t find support
→ There are other outside problems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Family Constraints</th>
<th>Job-Related Only</th>
<th>Can’t Find Good Opportunities</th>
<th>Income Related</th>
<th>Community Problems</th>
<th>Can’t Find Support</th>
<th>There are Other Outside Problems</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>50%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Similar to CBK Graduates, Current Students also identified both “family constraints” and “Income related” constraints as the two main difficulties in trying to find suitable employment. Of “family constraints” one student remarked that initially their family was opposed to her working at all; and another remarked that her husband does not like for her “to be involved with any job”. “Family First” seems to be one of the primary facets of attempting to work and earn in the Rayer Bazar area, and foremost where it concerns women in the household. “Support” again in this instance refers to “financial support” and the ability to access capital or credit in order to secure the means of starting and maintaining a business.

iii. Responses to the question: *What do you feel are some possible solutions for overcoming these [your constraints in finding employment] problems?* (Multiple responses possible)

Given responses:
→ More/Better Skills/Training for Employment
→ More (General) Educational Opportunities
→ More Financial Support
→ More Community Support
→ More Access to Better Jobs
→ Less Problems from Outside
→ Less Problems from Community

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>50%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Also similar to CBK Graduates, Current Students first and foremost identified the need for more “financial support” (in the form of loans and access to capital) as a key solution to overcoming the constraints faced when attempting to find employment. This response was closely followed by “more/better skills training”; “more general educational opportunities”; and “more support from the community”.

iv. Responses to the question: What do you see as being the best business opportunities, or possibilities for employment and income in your area, can you list them? (Multiple responses given)

Garments-related Businesses were mentioned in 100% of responses by CBK Current Students.

Non-garments-related businesses were mentioned in 50% of responses by current students. Among the non-garments-related businesses specifically mentioned by graduates were the following:

When asked: Why can’t you take advantage of these opportunities?—Lack of access to capital and materials resources was mentioned several times specifically. Family constraints were also cited again. Most simply stated that they were not taking advantage of these opportunities because the were “still students”.

v. Responses to the question: Which kinds of businesses/people in your area are unsuccessful, and why do you think that is?

Current students also felt that the lack of success in business and/or employment in the area of Rayer Bazar was due to the absence of industry, and to an unsuitable business environment. “Fast food” or “air conditioning and refrigeration services” were again mentioned as unsuccessful businesses on account of inhabitants of Rayer Bazar by and large not being able to afford the services.

vi. Responses to the question: What is your preferred or most suitable form of employment?

Given responses:
- Self Employment
- Micro Enterprise (Producer Groups)
- Wage Employment

90% of CBK Current Students specified their preferred from of employment as being “self employment”. Current students mentioned their inability to work outside of the household and therefore had “made the intention to run [their] own businesses from home”. At least two others remarked that they had physical ailments which kept them from seeking out employment outside of their households. Where it concerned wage employment, only one current student had a preference. This was due to their feeling that they would not be able to purchase their own machine which would be necessary for them to operate a business independently and from within the household.

vii. Responses to question: Which skills to you think workers need to improve in order to gain better employment, or opportunities for generating income?

In descending order of frequency of responses (as well as complete rage of remarks):

1. Demand/Market Oriented Skills
2. Specialized skills training
3. General Education
4. “Devotion” to work

viii. Responses to question: What were your reasons for joining the CBK program? (Multiple Responses Possible)
General responses from the interviewees were grouped together according to the following similar responses. The question in this instance did, however, generate a seeming majority with regard to the category of “gaining technical skills”. As such, the findings for this question regarding current students do not exhibit as much of a range as it had for graduates.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>70%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ix. Responses to question: Do you think that the training you received from CBK was effective/good?

Given responses:
→ Very Very Good and Effective
→ Only Good only Maybe Effective
→ Don’t Know
→ Not Good Not Really Effective
→ Very Very Bad and Not Effective At All

50% of current CBK students responded that they felt the training was “very very good and effective”. The majority of these responses were also based on the opinion that CBK Graduates who were working in the area were able to earn an income as a result of completing the training.

x. Responses to the question: What was lacking in the training you received from CBK that could have improved the quality of the training that you received? (Multiple responses possible)

Given responses:
→ Needs Better Teachers/Trainers
→ Needs Better Learning Materials/Tools
→ Needs Better Facilities
→ Needs Better Schedule for Classes (More/Different Times)
→ Needs MORE Courses in DIFFERENT Skills/Trades
→ Needs BETTER Courses on CURRENT Skills/Trades

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Better Teacher/Trainers</th>
<th>Better Learning Materials</th>
<th>Better Facilities</th>
<th>Better Schedule for Classes</th>
<th>More Courses in Different Trades</th>
<th>Better Courses in Current Trades</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Following the trend seen in the graduates’ responses, current CBK students unanimously declared that their training could have been better if they were trained in “more modern tools and materials”. And also in a similar fashion, current students listed more mechanized tools that they would like to receive training on.

xi. Responses to the question: Would you move to another area/district/region for employment, yes or no/why or why not?

90% of current students remarked that they would NOT move on the basis of available employment opportunities—also citing family constraints as well as wanting to pursue business opportunities in the
area of Rayer Bazar. Only one current student remarked that they would move for employment elsewhere, stating that there is “too much competition for jobs in Dhaka”; although they did not specify where they would hypothetically move to, nor did they give examples.

xii. Responses to the question: What are your future plans in view of the training you have received, and your experiences with CBK in terms of career planning? (Multiple responses possible)

Given responses:
- Keep Same Employment
- Try to Expand Your Business
- Try to Increase Quality of Your Business
- Look for New Employment
- Look for New Educational Opportunities
- Look for New Skills/Training Opportunities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Keep Same Employment</th>
<th>Try to Expand Business</th>
<th>Increase the Quality of Business</th>
<th>Look for New Employment</th>
<th>Look for Ed. Opportunities</th>
<th>Look for Training Opportunities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10%</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Almost a two-thirds majority of current CBK students remarked that their future plans after completing their training would be towards business “expansion” although most only remarked that they were planning to start a small/self-employed businesses after finishing the training.

xiii. Responses to questions: Would you like to have more or better training in your skill or trade from CBK? Would you like to have more training in another skill or trade?

100% of Current CBK Students responded that they would like to have more training in current skills and trades from CBK.

Only 50% of current CBK students stated that they would like to have more training in another skill or trade, and again, all of the trades mentioned specifically were the garments-related trades that CBK is presently offering (i.e. embroidery and block batik).

**CDL/CBK Administrator and Teacher/Trainer Responses**

In contrast to the two previous sections of findings and responses, this section will detail only qualitative findings from the KIIs with CDL/CBK administrators. The responses given below are the result of more in depth interviews with the particular stakeholders; as communication between KII guideline objectives were not as constrained in approaching various subject matter with administrators and teacher/trainers, there is a much greater elaboration of concepts and ideas in response to the questions posed (in italics below).

i. **Is your NGO involved with the government in the planning and implementation of training programs?**
   If YES please explain (type of involvement, which agencies or branches etc):
   
   CDL and CBK are not involved with any government planning; there is a connection with the NGO affairs Bureau which conducts some Monitoring and Evaluation of program activities; registration; and Annual reviews.

ii. **Do you issue certifications for your training courses? If so, who recognizes them, and do they have any relevance to government/national/international skills standards?**
YES, CDL issues certificates for trainings, which are recognized by some garment factories—These certificates ARE NOT registered with the government authorities though they maintain national level guidelines in their independent certification.

iii. Do you think there is sufficient skills development and training accessible to the populations in the CBK working areas?

NO, there is only enough to provide nominal support in the working areas, which creates some changes for individuals in the community and lifestyles/livelihoods, but there is not sufficient availability to meet current demand for skills training. The population in this area is roughly 20-30,000

Please explain how you feel skills development training can be useful in this area:

Training should cater to jobless people to improve their life/livelihood skills in order to increase income generation. Training in skills/trades should be demand-centered/market-oriented, and programming should be adaptable to the shifting demand and market conditions. If trainings could be more holistic in terms of different types of support offered (e.g. accounting; management; child rearing; financial support and access to capital for acquisition of resources)—skills training could help to build confidence in the individuals who are receiving the training; as well helping to increase awareness about the benefits of the training. “Local elite” should also be involved in the implementation of program goals and objectives. More modern machines, tools and equipment should be used in the training programs—as well, graduates should have better access to procuring modern machines and equipment for use in their businesses.

How can access to skills training and development be increased in CBK working areas?

Limited space for training makes it extremely difficult to expand the offering of, and access to training and services provided under organizational programming—setting up auxiliary training centers in other areas of Dhaka City might be a way of expanding—CDL has experience setting up new facilities, but is lacking access to finances that would make it possible to do so effectively. Some assistance should be provided by and sought out from the surrounding community (or communities if/when expanded)—in the form of space for training courses and property for facilities (this would not be solicited from Slum Inhabitants themselves, but rather landowners and municipal/governmental/community leaders and/or officials). Increasing the amount of space available to train would mean an ability to increase the number of students in each trade. Whenever there is a “new demand” in the market, market-oriented trades should be adapted within the training programs.

Arranging partnerships with other local organizations can help to expand the resource base available to the programs—initially contributed through donor funding, but with enough technical support for the programs to eventually become self sustaining. Programming could also be supported and eventually sustained by fee-based services provided for by certain aspects of the programming (e.g. for the training itself; or for other provisions). Training programs should be extended beyond Dhaka to rural areas of Bangladesh in order to aid youth who are often traveling independently outside of rural areas in search of work—who end up being exploited in human trafficking and forced labor—crowded into urban slums further extending cycles of poverty.

iv. Do you have any (contractual/formal/informal) relationship with external training providers such as TTCs and TSCs, public or private?

Yes/E NGOs: Caritas; BRAC, UCEP, ASK (Ain Shalish Kendra)—Government: NGO Affairs Bureau, Department of Women’s Affairs
v. What are your thoughts about how training programs at the community level can be more effective and successful in delivering skills and training?

Any type of training should be based on improving the life and livelihoods of men and women who are without the means of viable and meaningful skills development and workplace training—according to the “best way” of carrying out workplace functions and the performance of jobs i.e. training needs to be of a high quality and standard. Programming should also include placements for “interns” or “apprentices” to learn TOT (Training of Trainers/Teachers) as a part of the curriculum. Training should also include “fashion” wears (for men’s and women’s clothing) that can create a competitive advantage for graduates in the CBK working areas to access other markets. The duration of courses should be increased, and course curriculum should be expanded to include new trades. Coursework, tools and materials should be modernized and made current with market/work conditions/standards and demand.

Surveys and feasibility studies should be conducted in order to identify community needs. Through post-training support, services and activities: Job placement/employment linkages by matching employer needs in order to increase the accessibility to wage employment; Business/startup support; Financial support to graduates (e.g. access to credit). Community leaders should be involved in overall programming. Campaigning within the CBK working area(s) and local community can be conducted in order to promote the programs themselves amongst community members, businesses and organizations. A revolving fund could be initiated in the program to offer financial assistance to graduates of the program who are in need of funds to start a self-employed business.

vi. How would you assess the capacity of your organization to deliver trainings in the future?

There is a strong need for considerable up-skilling and capacity building of existing staff, however, the programs are currently focusing on market demand for skills locally, and they are able to provide these demand-centered trainings for locals. The demand for these skills and trainings in the CBK working area is still high.

In the future it seems as though continuing programs will be dependent on donor funds—programming should move away from donor assistance in the future. Profit and revenue generating schemes for CDL and CBK need to eventually cover operational costs directly. This should be done through a commercial endeavor to market fashionable “wares” through the program participants training and development—resulting in a CBK “line” or “brand” of products. Awareness building through communications and publications about program activities can also serve as a means of effective marketing.

What kinds of assistance/resources would help you?

→ More well-trained teacher/trainers and program staff—more training opportunities in refresher courses and up-skilling in specialized fields.
→ Need for more modern machines, tools and equipment for training.
→ Better access to and/or management of revenue sources and budgetary planning.
→ Development of partnerships with other organizations.
→ Financial and technical support to program operations as well to as students and graduates.

vii. Can you please list and explain any of the difficulties and constraints that you have experienced in the implementation of your training programs:

→ Lack of funding—financial /budget constraints—lack of access to the best training materials and tools.
Lack of instructors (teacher/trainers)—who are highly skilled and trained themselves, including program officers and supervisors—who should also have more “contact” with graduates and students

Lack of facilities and space for program activities

Many trainees are “impermanent” in that they move around quite a bit—need for better correspondence with trainees/graduates

What were the reasons for these difficulties and/or constraints?

With current budgetary resources, CDL/CBK is only able to hire one instructor per trade. Problems with both trainers and trainees who only have basic, less-than basic or insufficient literacy and numeracy skills—this is important in the calculating and measuring aspects of tailoring, sewing, cutting and other garments-related trades—as well as more technical machine operation.

The number of trainings is not sufficient to meet market demand for specific skills, products/items. An inability to purchase better teaching materials/tools for increased quality of training also constrains progress; and the lack of awareness amongst community members as to the benefits of training—has highlighted the need for awareness building programs and for facilitating direct contact with community members.

viii. What is the rate of retention for participants who have completed your training courses?

Estimated that “99%” or the “vast majority” of trainees complete the programs—there aren’t that many “dropouts”. The majority of graduates are able to find means of employment after completing their courses.

ix. If participants are unable to secure employment after completion of training, what are some reasons for this?

As most of the graduates are women they tend to only be interested to work in their homes in self-employed businesses. In this respect, if these women are unable to secure the necessary resources (e.g. sewing machines, etc), they will be unable to successfully start maintaining their businesses. This is mainly due to a lack of access to capital and/or credit.

Some of the participants are simply just not as proficient as other graduates and as such are not as employable as those who are better at learning or performing in their skill/trade. In addition, there are not enough employment opportunities particularly for women—the majority of whom want to work independently from within their homes and are in need of startup capital or access to credit to purchase materials for initiating business activities.

x. What happens to participants who DO NOT successfully complete the training courses?

There is not accurate information on these individuals due to the lack of capacity in student/graduate tracking; but typically, when they are unable to find secure employment based on skills and trades, they typically forced to acquire work which is hazardous or exploitative, and thus, have a lower earning potential. In addition, social constraints also apply—e.g. marriage, or the restriction by family members of working outside of the home or at all. Others may not appreciate the importance of training, or the opportunities that it can provide for better employment and income.

xi. What is the RATIO of Males to Females in your training programs? Do you have exact figures?
xii. How could the CBK training programs become sustainable in the long-term?

Executive Director CDL: “Currently program activities at the operational level are not sustainable.”

Increase access to financial support for program graduates—increase support services offered by the program/organization; and create revenue/income-generating programs (such as fee-based services)—or find investment for the establishment of full-scale production unit for Branded garments items to be sold in larger and up-scale markets at a shop or boutique in higher-income urban areas—graduates would be able to supply products for sale in this style of shop or boutique—this would also necessitate the creation of a design training program. Buyers would need to be contacted and proper methods for business development in this regard would have to be provided through technical support and training of program staff (attention to fashions and seasonality, business management, and marketing)

Fundraising and awareness building campaigns—for support of revolving funds set up for program and participant/trainee support services—funding/revenue could also provide for the establishment of new trades courses in the curriculum

xiii. How could you increase the scale/reach of the training programs?

The number of trades being offered in the programs could be increased through curriculum development; and programs should be designed competitively by only offering high quality/high value trainings in order to attract new students as well as make graduates more economically viable and marketable in terms of services—furthermore by establishing training centers in different slum areas of Dhaka City, and increasing the volume of students enrolling in CBK programs.

In your working areas?

→ Up-skilling of training for teacher/trainers
→ Publicity and awareness building campaigns in the working areas of the program
→ Better organizational planning—capacity building in organizational management, monitoring and evaluation for increased program support through a structured and systematic approach—this could include a job placement program or outreach center for graduates

In other areas of Bangladesh?

→ Training centers in other cities based on CDL (24) district-level programs women’s and community-based support groups in Bangladesh—local networks and advisory committees established under CDL programs.
→ Creating a job-placement program
→ Setting up revolving funds for supporting different activities on a national basis

xiv. Could you predict the future demand of type of workers?

High skill in garments/fashion/design; Electrical; Welding; Mechanical and machine maintenance; Plumbing and pipe-fitting; Automotive; Carpentry; Printing

xv. Which areas do you need assistance in training workers?

→ Training of Trainers and technical support to CDL/CBK staff.
→ Establishing training courses for new trades and social training (e.g. business management, family planning, et al)—offering capacity building programs and skills refresher courses for graduates as well as CDL/CDK staff.

→ Accounting for financial/fiscal maintenance—recruiting and maintaining staff for financial/fiscal management.

→ Coordinating activities for programming, monitoring and evaluation.

→ Increasing capacity through larger training venues (i.e. more space for training)—in order to increase the enrollment capacity of CBK to take new students and/or offer new training courses.

→ Linkages with other government and private training centers—for TOT, management, or providing better ideas on how to run operations and programs.

xvi. Other than the current activities, what activities would the people in the community be interested in pursuing?

There should be programming options for those living in the slums who have higher educational experience and training—further training and programs for these individuals (eg. Hotel/Restaurant Mgmt; ICT related services; Financial Mgmt Services; Automotive/Drivers—skills and trades training courses)

Additional garments-based training: Computerized machine operation; Fusing machine; Pray Machine; Fabrics (Dye and Color); Computerized Design Programs.

Tailoring/Garments Shop Owner; Footwear Business; Karghupi (hand-sewing embroidery of saris and fabrics); Sales; Nursing; TV/Electronics Manufacturing and Technicians; Banking; Teaching/Instructors/Trainers; Electrical; Welding; Mechanical and machine maintenance.

xvii. What are non-traditional activities or opportunities available in your district?

Vegetable sellers (female); Carpentry workers (female); Traffic Police (female); Tea Stall; Grocers (female); Female automotive technicians.

5. STRATEGIES AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The Strategies and Recommendations have been based on the findings and responses generated from the three stakeholder groups of the Study and Impact Assessment (CBK Graduates, CBK Current Students and CDL/CDK Administrators and Teacher/Trainers). The recommendations will be grouped into two different levels of change and initiation: 1) change at the organizational level in terms of capacity, planning, management and delivery; 2) change in scope of programs in terms of scale-up and expansion. The rationale for these different macro- and micro-level changes will be discussed as points of departure and enumerated below.

Organizational Change

Capacity building should take place at the organizational level—focusing on programs and personnel. Technical Assistance can be provided on a range of capacity-building interventions for both CDL and CBK.

1) A further and more feasibility and marketing surveys should be undertaken to determine economic realities and relationships for and between inhabitants and businesses in the area of Rayer Bazar; as well to further measure the total economic impact of the CBK programs inside as well as outside of the...
program area. Under a comprehensive market survey, employers as well as patrons and consumers can be interviewed to provide a detailed vantage of spending patterns, as well as business trends and profitability in the area—demand for goods, services and skills; as well as new employment and business opportunities in the area, and the potential for businesses and producers (existing and future) to enter into larger, local, distant, national and international markets.

2) Increase the capacities of CDL and CBK Administrators and Teacher/Trainers—Administrators should be well versed and trained in organizational management; Teacher/Trainers should be able to attend up-skilling courses in trades related to training, as well as the delivery of course curricula.

3) Increase organizational capacities—utilization of technology to track current, and former students through web based technical applications, design and maintenance.

4) New technologies should steadily be incorporated into both the organizational management programs; as well as within course curricula.

5) Skills-base within existing courses should be enhanced—demand-centered training should be developed in collaboration with national skill level, as well as industry standards. And certifications should be linked with national competency-based standards and assessment tools.

6) Linkages should be created with both the public and private sectors. Private sector industries should be included in future design of courses and training modules, as well as for creating job-placement/recruitment services. Organizational linkages with government programs for workforce capacity building and skills training should be made, and local Technical Training Centers and/or Technical Schools and Colleges should also be utilized in order to enhance the scope and effectiveness of training (particularly with regard to teacher/trainers).

7) The CBK should forge linkages with national policy programs and NGO program interventions based in workforce capacity development and technical skills training (e.g. the International Labor Organization’s Technical and Vocational Educational Training (TVET) reform project; or the UNDP Urban Partnerships for Poverty Reduction Project (UPPRP)). TVET reform is currently looking at nationally-based competency standards for assessment and accreditation and policy changes for skills development through technical and vocational educational institutions; while the UPPRP program has launched a national apprenticeship training program).

8) CDL and CBK should develop new support programs and services which can be extended to students who have completed the course training (inclusive of financial support and counseling; employment support; and business support to entrepreneurs). Support programs can provide fee-based services in the community at Rayer Bazar, and could help to generate revenue for increased program funding. Outreach should also comprise awareness-building and advocacy campaigns for social issues involving worker rights, gender equality, social entrepreneurship and vital community issues.

**Scale-up and Expansion**

After a substantial drive towards building organizational capacity and the program and personnel level—ultimately strengthening the efficacy and effectiveness of organizational development and operations; CDL and CBK can move towards the scale-up and expansion of their vocational training programs in terms of both outreach and depth in coverage through strategic interventions under programming.

8) Course curricula should be vastly expanded in terms of number and breadth of technical and vocational trades and training offered under CBK curricula. New trades should be demand-centered and based on well directed market research and survey analysis. Any new and additional trades offered under CBK vocational training should also be linked with national skills programs and policy initiatives (such as TVET).

9) CBK training should also include comprehensive Entrepreneurship Development and Business Management (EDBM) training as a resource to trainees attempting to run small enterprises, production unit clusters, or independent self-operated businesses (EDBM would also include accounting and financial managements skills, marketing and resource/prodution management).
10) Revenue generation schemes can be further developed as a means of securing sustainability of funding for programs and operations overheads/costs. Fee-based services for community support programs should be expanded and enhanced so as to offer both competitive as well as comparative advantage in delivering services.

11) The organizational layout of CDL and CBK should be redesigned to follow educational/institutional planning models—with departmentalization of administrative functions (e.g. admissions, finance, student services, accounts services, technology, faculty, business development, programs, etc)—so that functionality can eventually be raised on par with international educational institutions—seeking out international associations and accreditations.

12) The basic model of the CBK tailoring shop should be invested in as a legitimate business opportunity, and developed on a similar business model to that of the Aarong retail chain of clothing and handicrafts, which was supported and developed by BRAC (Bangladesh Rural Advancement Committee)—and is now an internationally recognized business and social development enterprise. Establishing a market brand for CBK students and graduates production, could potentially be a boon both to the beneficiary participants, as well as to CDL and CBK respectively.

13) Programs and organizational support could furthermore be driven by international capital/funding campaigns. These funding drives could also serve as a means of marketing for the organization, which could further be enhanced using the products of the CBK students and graduates (as high-end fabrics and wears) at an export quality of fashionable design and construction.

14) With a firm drive for capital and funding from international organizations such as donors, trusts, foundations and NGOs, a sustainable CDL and CBK could invest in “brick and mortar” developments of facilities and installations—increasing reach within slum catchments in Dhaka, as well as expanding programs to rural areas under district level CDL operations within any of the 24 district-level programs. International funding can also produce cooperation and memoranda for Technical Assistance and Knowledge Transfers from specialist in organizational development, program and institutional design.

6. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

This report has shown in a comprehensive breakdown of both quantified/quantitative and qualitative data, a general purview of the situation facing students and graduates of the CBK vocational training program at Rayer Bazar, in Dhaka City. Furthermore, the figures and descriptive information have provided an overall synopsis of the impact of the CBK vocational programs administered by the CDL under current funding by Swisscontact. While the information given here has not meant to provide statistical accuracy in relationship to the sample of respondents, all of the information gathered has relevance to the subject herein which is how graduates and currents students feel about the success and effectiveness of the CBK training relative to the changes it has brought about in their lives respectively.

Generally speaking, the participants in the survey have all confer that the programs have been helpful to them in securing suitable employment that allows them to generate income within the social, familial and financial constraints that they face in the slum environment at Rayer Bazar. While the increase in subsistence from income generated (by employed graduates) under employment activities sustained by the training received from CBK may in fact seem slim to marginal overall—the personal testimony given in KIs shows that this seemingly subtle increase in household income and sustenance has made not only a noticeable impact on the lives of the majority of CBK graduates, but this impact as revealed by the program participants themselves shows this perceived subtlety to be a profound change in the lives and livelihoods of graduates utilizing the skills training that they have received.

The recommendations and strategies given in the report reflect the reflections and remarks given by all of the respondents in the survey. Practicality demonstrates that even though the overall impact of the CBK vocational training program has proven successful, there are sill a range of considerations that must be given to the limitations and opportunities for program enhancements through capacity building, increased
organizational proficiency and management, up-scaling and sustainability measures, general policy guidelines for organizational development, and outreach through programs and procedures developed for marketing and awareness building around program initiatives and strategic objectives.

First and foremost, more information is needed in order to provide meaningful and clear direction for future funding measures and program development for strategic interventions. Feasibility and market studies should lead the way as far as the next steps for addressing the course ahead for the organization of programs under CDL leadership, more generally, and CBK vocational programs specifically. Ultimately, the advantages and underlying organizational foundations of the CDL and CBK should be utilized forthrightly, as the potential for creating a much more expansive and effective venue of programs developing skills training and capacity building under CBK, presently exists.

In conclusion, there is a very real opportunity to support the programs of CDL and CBK in an effort to create a comprehensive program that can be demonstrated as a feasible and readily available model for workforce capacity building, skills training and livelihoods development in Bangladesh. The scope for a considerable up-scaling and expansion of programming exists currently, and with the appropriate linkages (public, private and donor-related), technical support and design for the future course of strategic programming, CDL and CBK show the potential to become flagship programs in Bangladesh on how to demonstrate an effective capacity-building program for livelihoods development, and skills training through vocational education.
ANNEXES

Annex 1 – Case Profiles

Mrs. Yesmin Akhter Jhunu is 25 years old, married with one child living in a household of four. She completed the CBK training two years ago and has since been working as a self-employed tailor in the area of Rayer Bazar.

Prior to joining with the CBK training, Jhunu was briefly engaged in bag-making work with some of the members of her family. Jhunu would take orders from local businesses in the area sewing single use shopping bags. For every 100 bags she would sew, she would earn approximately 30 Bangladeshi Taka. Even though Jhunu only worked in this job for about 3 months, she worked very hard, and sewed on average about 3,000 bags per month earning roughly 900 Taka per month contributing to her household income.

After seeing posters for the CBK training in her area, and being further encouraged by her mother-in-law, Jhunu decided to start the training in tailoring and sewing. “I felt my previous employment was very difficult job for not that much pay, I thought that some training would make my job easier.”

Currently, Jhunu is sourcing clothing orders from within the community at Rayer Bazar. Jhunu charges a certain fee for her labor on each piece of clothing she sews. For sewing Shalwar Khamis, Jhunu charges about 80 Taka, and is able to measure, cut and sew about 3-4 Shalwars per day.

Now Jhunu contributes between 3,000 and 4,000 Taka to her household’s income each month. With the extra income she is earning, Jhunu is able to pay for her son to attend kindergarten, and with her husband, has started a savings account, and purchased an insurance policy. Jhunu and her husband plan to save enough money to invest in her own tailoring shop, and for which she will also apply for financing.

Jhunu enjoyed working with the teachers at the CBK vocational training program. She also enjoyed learning the course material and would encourage others to join the program as well.

Mrs. Razia Beguam is also a 25-year-old living and working as a tailor in the Rayar Bazar area. Razia lives in a household with 10 others of her family, including her only child. Razia is divorced from her husband, who is neither present in their lives, nor does he contribute financially to their wellbeing. Razia has been working for the past year since completing her training at CBK.

Previously Razia worked in a sweater factory in Jigatola, which is near to Dhanmondi and the area of Rayer Bazar. Razia was a Dial Linking Machine operator for 10 years in the garments industry—joining individual pieces of sweaters. Razia’s income fluctuated throughout the year during her employment in the factory on account of the seasonal demand for production. When there were no orders, she would be guaranteed a base salary of 1,800 Taka per month, and would be paid according to the size of orders as they came into the factory. One small orders, Razia might earn about 3,000 Taka per month. On larger orders,
however, she could earn up to 10,000 Taka per month—and would sometimes have to work for a straight 24-hour shift in order to fill orders on schedule.

All in all, Razia said she felt that this was a “good experience” for her, but one day the factory was closed. Razia expected that production at the factory would eventually start again, and waited 6 months without attempting to find another job, but it was never reopened.

Instead of attempting to find another job in a factory, Razia, who is a former student of the CBK basic educational program and a Class V graduate—had known about the vocational training program at CBK for quite some time, and decided to join the classes. Even though Razia’s uncle had owned a tailoring shop, she had never received any skills training in tailoring and sewing previously.

Currently, Razia is working from her home taking orders from the community at Rayer Bazar, and is earning about 2,000 Taka per month contributing to her family’s household. While she feels that she would prefer to work in a more stable form of employment such as in a garments factory (which she feels provides a steady source of income), Razia appreciates being able to work in her own business from her home.

In the future, Razia says she would like to find more work in a factory in the (RMG) industry. As such, Razia also plans to maintain her current home-based business in addition. Razia and her two sisters, who have also worked in garments factories, plan to open up a tailoring shop together in the future. Razia plans to train them on maintaining the business and filling orders from the community while working at home. Razia plans to manage the entire operation, while also working in a garments factory (where she will also try to employ the skills she received from CBK). Razia is confident that she will be able to effectively manage her business since her work in the factory will be seasonal.

Razia thinks that the CBK training is very good for the women in the Rayer Bazar area on account of their being able to work from home once they have completed the training—Razia feels that “anyone” can take the training and will be able to work afterwards. Razia feels that women’s lives are often very hard on account of their individual circumstances and outcomes. Sometimes husbands will leave their wives, or won’t be able to earn a good income themselves. Razia feels that skills training is a way for women to be able to provide, and can ultimately help them “survive” difficult circumstances.

Mrs. Oleda Sulatana (principal of CBK basic and vocational education programs), and Mrs. Sheuly Roselyne Palma (CDL Director of Programs) are responsible, in part of their duties, for overseeing the vocational training program at CBK in Rayer Bazar. Both are very passionate about the progress and success of the CBK training, and its relevance in the working area, but also have points of how they feel that the program has been constrained and how well it will be able to operate in the future.

Mrs. Palma stated that on account of “many people not having the opportunity to go to school or to be educated, or for skills development—they can’t establish employment, or their rights” on account of being forced to work in exploitative, low-income jobs. Ms Palma feels that the training at CBK ultimately helps
to build “confidence levels in addition to increasing income levels and living conditions through skills training.”

Mrs. Sultana also feels that women in the area of Rayer Bazar are at risk of ending up in hazardous forms of employment without relevant and meaningful skills training. “There is a huge demand for the skills and training offered through this program… new market oriented trades could be opened in the program, and this way CBK can increase the number of students in each trade.”

Both women feel that the CBK training program can be significantly enhanced through a range of activities, that would not only serve as a boon to the organizations CDL and CBK respectively, but that would also enhance their effectiveness for the participants, students and graduates of the training. Both women feel that stronger programs with increased organizational support within the administrative functions, as well as programmatic and post-programmatic support for students and graduates of CBK—will ultimately increase the efficacy and reach of the CBK program trainings, as well as their relevance and impact in the program working areas.
Annex 3 – Sample Questionnaire

**CBK Graduates KII**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questionnaire No</th>
<th>:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Type</td>
<td>:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date of Interview</td>
<td><em><strong>/</strong></em>/2009.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interviewer</td>
<td>____________________</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Name and Address of respondent:**

______________________________

Sex: □ Male □ Female Age: _______

Marital Status: 1. Married 2. Single

No. of Children: _______ Household Size: _______

**Level of Education/Training & Name of Ed. Institution(s)/Program(s):**

______________________________

Employer: ___________________/Unemployed: ___ No. of Months: ___

Employer Address: ____________________________

E-mail: ____________________________

Working Area: ____________________________

Telephone: ____________________________

Cell: ____________________________

City/Area of Origin: ____________________________

Current Living Situation: ____________________________
Background

2. What is your current occupation or source(s) of income? (please list all along with monthly income):

3. What is your total household income per month?

4. Do you feel that this is a suitable source of employment for you?
   → Yes I think it’s very good__
   → Yes I think it’s ok but not best/could be better__
   → No I don’t think my current employment is suitable at all__
   If not best, or not at all suitable—what do you feel would be a better/more suitable form of employment for you?

5. Do you/have you utilized any sources of financing? (Private Banks, Micro Finance, NGO, Private company lender, etc). Yes / No
   Please list institutions:

6. What are the major constraints that you see yourself facing in having or trying to find the best employment? (Check any that will apply)
   → Family Constraints__
   → Job – Related Only__
   → Can’t find good Opportunities__
   → Income Related__
   → Community Problems__
   → Can’t find support__
   → There are other outside problems__
   Can you describe them in more detail:

7. What do you feel are some possible solutions for overcoming these problems? (Please check all that apply)
   → More/Better Skills/Training for Employment__
   → More (General) Educational Opportunities__
   → More Financial Support__
   → More Community Support__
   → More Access to Better Jobs__
   → Less Problems from Outside__
   → Less Problems from Community__
   Can you please describe solutions in more detail:

8. What do you see as being the best business opportunities, or possibilities for employment and income in your area, can you list them?
   Why can’t you take advantage of these opportunities?
9. Which kinds of businesses/people in your area are UNSUCCESSFUL, and why do you think that is (Please describe)?

10. What is your preferred or most suitable form of employment?
    → Self Employment_
    → Micro Enterprise (Producer Groups)_
    → Wage Employment_
    Can you please explain why, what are the advantages of working this way?

11. Which skills do YOU think workers need to improve in order to get better employment, or opportunities for generating income?

Training—

12. Can you please describe your work activities before joining the CBK program:

13. What were your reasons for wanting to join with the CBK program?

14. Can you please list/describe the training that you received from CBK:

15. Do you think that the training you were given at CBK was effective/good?
    → Very Very Good and Effective_
    → Only Good only Maybe Effective_
    → Don’t Know_
    → Not Good Not Really Effective_
    → Very Very Bad and Not Effective At All_
    Please explain, how/why/why not:

16. What were the major differences you experienced in your life due to CBK Training (Please Check All that Apply)?
    → Better Income_
    → Better Job/Employment_
    → Better Family/Household Situation_
    → Better Situation/More Respect in Community_
    → Only a little Change but Not Much Life Change_
    → No Real Life Change after CBK Training at All_
    Can you please explain your life changes in more detail:

17. What was lacking in the training you received from CBK that could have improved the quality of training that you received? (Please check all that apply)
    → Needs Better Teachers/Trainers_
    → Needs Better Learning Materials/Tools_
    → Needs Better Facilities_
→ Needs Better Schedule for Classes (More/Different Times)__
→ Needs MORE Courses in DIFFERENT Skills/Trades__
→ Needs BETTER Courses on CURRENT Skills/Trades__
Can you explain in more detail, and list any other improvements you think are needed:

18. Can you please list other employment opportunities are available to you in other areas/regions/districts of Bangladesh, and whether you would be willing to move based on these opportunities:
   → Yes I would move to another area/district/region for employment__
   → No I would not move to another area/district/region/for employment__
Why or Why not?

IF you would move—What Employment opportunities exist in OTHER regions in Bangladesh that you would move for?

19. In the event that you are not hired by an employer, how would you find out about other employment opportunities in your field/trade?
   → From family/friends/acquaintances__
   → Through print/electronic media__
   → From Internet__
   → Other__ (please specify/explain below):

20. What are your future plans in view of the training you have received, and your experiences with CBK in terms of career planning?
   → Keep Same Employment__
   → Try to Expand Your Business__
   → Try to Increase Quality of Your Business__
   → Look for New Employment__
   → Look for New Educational Opportunities__
   → Look for New Skills/Training Opportunities__
Please describe Future Plans:

21. Would you like to have more or better training in YOUR skill/trade CBK? YES / NO
   Do you know what kinds of Training in your trade you would need? Please List Any:

22. Would you like to have more training in ANOTHER skill/trade? YES / NO
   Can you please list New Skills or Trades:

Enumerator Notes, Comments and Observations: